

MINUTES OF MEETING OF COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
HELD IN WASHINGTON, D. C., OCTOBER 26, 1922.

The third meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts during the fiscal year 1923 was held in its office at 1729 New York Avenue, Northwest, Washington, D. C., Thursday, October 26, 1922.

The following members were present:

Mr. Moore, Chairman,
Mr. Greenleaf,
Mr. Fraser,
Mr. Ayres,
Mr. Mowbray,

also Mr. H. P. Caemmerer, Secretary and
Executive Officer.

The meeting was called to order at 9:30 a.m.

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PRECEDING MEETING: The minutes of the meeting held September 7, 1922, were approved.
2. MEDAL FOR THE BUREAU OF MINES: Revised designs (A and B) for the reverse of the medal for the Bureau of Mines, made by Mr. B. Nebel, sculptor, of Pittsburgh, were brought to the attention of the Commission, and in the consideration of them Mr. F. J. Bailey, Assistant to the Director of the Bureau of Mines, was present. Design A was selected for the reverse, with the suggestion that the words MINE RESCUE be placed underneath the lantern. Mr. Bailey made inquiry regarding the obverse, calling attention to the fact that the apron should be omitted from the person carrying the victim(Exhibit A).

Mr. Bailey stated that it would be desired to make copies of the large medal, which will be about 9 inches in diameter, for the use of the individual members of the miners' organizations and that if Congress provides a similar appropriation of \$1,000 next year the Bureau of Mines will have a medal made to be awarded for First Aid work. Mr. Fraser suggested making the reductions

for the winning team(six in each team) 2 3/4 inches in diameter. Small silver medals, the size of a fifty-cent piece, to be worn on a watch fob or similar to a war decoration, will be made for the individual members of the winning organization(about 80).

The Commission recommended that the obverse and the reverse of the large medal be mounted side by side on a frame of mahogany, and that the inscription commemorating the award be engraved on a plate and placed on the frame, underneath the medal.

3. STATUE OF A MARINE, PARIS ISLAND, S. C.: Under date of September 22, 1922, Major General Lejeune, Commandant of the United States Marine Corps, submitted the following letter to the Commission, with a design for a statue of a Marine, to be erected at Paris Island, S. C.:

"I am enclosing herewith some correspondence I have just received from Brigadier General Eli K. Cole, commanding the Marine Corps post at Paris Island, S. C., relative to a proposed memorial to be erected at that post in honor of those Marines who were trained at Paris Island and who lost their lives during the World War.

A proposal to erect this memorial has been received from Captain Robert Aitken, a photograph of whose design is attached, but before taking any definite action in the matter we are anxious to get an authoritative opinion on the merits of his proposed statue from an artistic point of view.

It is for this reason that I am taking the liberty of sending this correspondence to you, and I would greatly appreciate it if you would read it over, examine the photograph, and give me your opinion of the design submitted."

The Commission approved the design and suggested that a design for the pedestal and a location plan for the statue be submitted (Exhibit B).

4. AMERICAN CEMETERIES IN FRANCE: Belleau Wood- Mr. Moore reported that Mrs. James Carroll Fraser has taken up the matter of purchasing the plateau on which the Battle of Belleau Wood was fought, which is to be made a part of the American Cemetery at Belleau. The area comprises

89 hectares (220 acres) and the estimated cost is \$60,000. In the meantime the Belleau Wood Memorial Association, of which Mrs. Frazer is president, is rebuilding the town of Belleau.

Suresnes, - The Commission discussed matters concerning the development of the American Cemetery at Suresnes. Mr. Moore stated that Colonel Rethers, in charge of the Graves Registration Service in France, had written that considerable progress has been made in the development of this cemetery. The Commission considered the question of permanent location of the statue of the "Doughboy", in which Mrs. Willard Straight is interested. Mr. Greenleaf advised that at the time the members of the Commission were on the grounds in the spring of 1921, laying out the plan for the American Cemetery at Suresnes, the members disapproved placing the statue on the main axis, but a site near the northeast corner of the cemetery suggested itself as a very suitable location for this statue.

5. KEY BRIDGE, TREATMENT OF APPROACH AT ROSSLYN: Major M. C. Tyler, of the United States Engineers' Office, in charge of construction of the Key Bridge, appeared before the Commission with a design for the treatment of the approach at the Rosslyn end of the bridge. In company with Major Tyler were Mr. Jefferson V. Davis, General Manager of the Washington and Old Dominion Railway and Mr. F. E. Hill, architect, with designs for the proposed new terminal of the W. & O. D. Railway at Rosslyn.

Major Tyler informed the Commission that the plan he was submitting for the treatment of this approach had the approval of the Chief of Engineers. Under this new arrangement for trolley cars on the Key Bridge, the Capital Traction Company will extend their lines across the bridge and make a loop on the plaza at the Rosslyn end of the bridge. At the same time the

Washington and Old Dominion Railway and the Washington Virginia Railway will build their terminals on the Government Reservation.

The Commission considered the plan and made an inspection trip to the site in the afternoon. The Commission recommended to Major Tyler that the bridge approach at Rosslyn should be treated as an open plaza, the traffic to be directed by stone posts or similar device. Mr. Greenleaf urged that suitable planting be provided in connection with the treatment of the approach to the bridge. The locations of the terminal stations suggested in the design were approved.

The design for the terminal of the Washington and Old Dominion Railway was disapproved. The Commission considered the design too monumental, unrelated to the bridge, and the style inappropriate for the terminal proposed. The Commission advised that the design should call for a plain, dignified terminal station in harmony with the bridge, and recommended an entire restudy of the design for the station (Exhibit C).

6. NATIONAL LITERARY HALL OF FAME: Mr. William Douden, architect, of this city, submitted a design for a headquarters of the National Literary Society, with letter as follows:

October 25, 1922.

"At the suggestion of the Chairman of the Advisory Committee of the A. I. A., I beg to submit to you Plan, Section and Elevation of the National Literary Society Headquarters, titled the "National Literary Hall of Fame.

This is a private enterprise, incorporated in the District and in course of registration in every State of the Union.

The purpose of the Society is to promote excellence in Literature, Drama and Elocution by interscholastic competition among all who are members of the Society, with offers of certain prizes and the engraving of the names of the nine successful competitors from each State each year, in the marble panel work of the building, accumulation and distribution of the best contributions in Literature and Drama, meetings in the building at stated periods for competition in elocution and to supply traveling instructors or trainers for home talent plays. The society is incorporated without capital and all

revenue derived from the activities above actual expenses will be placed in a Student Loan Fund.

The lay-out is developed to cover these requirements. The first floor with its Rostrum and Gallery (Balcony) is to care for the public gatherings and exhibition of Engraved names and such pieces of Art as they choose to exhibit. Second story will be used for executive requirements. The third floor will be used for files and archives.

The success of the enterprise is fairly sure, although a site for the building has not yet been acquired.

The present headquarters of the National Literary Society is suite 507 International Building.

Any comments you may care to make on the desire or suggestions as to location, that will be helpful, will be appreciated."

The Commission considered the style (on the order of a State Capitol building) too monumental and inappropriate, the dome badly shaped, and too many parts for the size and scale of the building. The interior arrangement was thought very unsatisfactory. Mr. Ayres suggested a study of the Villa Rotonda, at Vicenza.

The Commission were informed that the following locations had been suggested for the building,--the square at 22d Street and New York Avenue, N.W., a site at 22d and S Streets, N. W., and on a part of the Dean Tract if the building could be built alongside the new Masonic Temple.

The Commission recommended a restudy of the design and held the matter of recommendation of a site in abeyance pending resubmission of the design.
(Exhibit D).

7. RESOLUTION H. J. 378, ARTS AND INDUSTRIES BUILDING: Under date of September 28, 1922, Hon. John W. Langley, Chairman of the House Committee on Public Buildings and Grounds, submitted the following letter to the Commission:

"Please favor the House Committee on Public Buildings and Grounds with the views of the Commission with regard to the joint resolution (H. J. Res. 378) "To create a commission to consider the proposal of a central building for art and industry in the District of Columbia.

A copy of the joint resolution is enclosed herewith for your information."

The Commission made a favorable report on the Joint Resolution, stating

that they could see no objection to the creation of a Commission to consider the proposition of a central building for Art and Industry in the District of Columbia. Mr. Moore suggested that the secretary of the Smithsonian Institution be added to the Commission (Exhibit E).

8. LOCATION FOR THE STATUE TO BASEBALL: Under date of October 2, 1922, Colonel Sherrill submitted the following letter to the Commission:

"The views of the Fine Arts Commission are requested as to a suitable site for the monument proposed by the American League of Baseball, as a gift to the people of the United States.

It is thought that a site somewhere in the vicinity of Hains' Point will be most appropriate, as this area is designed largely for athletic purposes.

There will be approximately \$100,000 available for the construction of this monument, and it is thought desirable to locate it within say about one-half mile of the point, but preferably not on the main axis, which should be reserved for some extensive treatment on behalf of the Government."

The Commission noted the suggestion that it is thought desirable to place the statue about one-half mile of Hains' Point, but as this would place the statue in the Picnic Grove near the south end of the Golf Course, the Commission did not favor this location.

The Commission felt that the most appropriate location for the statue in East Potomac Park is at the north end of the park, in the area set aside for baseball diamonds, football, etc., and recommended that the statue be placed in this location (Exhibit F). The Commission visited the grounds and observed that this part of East Potomac Park is at present undeveloped but thought that at least two years would elapse before the statue would be completed, during which time that section of the park could be developed to a considerable extent.

Mr. Fraser stated that he had met several times with the National Sculpture Society in New York, who are preparing the program of competition,

at the request and subject to the approval of the Commission of Fine Arts.

9. WOODHULL MEMORIAL FLAGPOLE: Mr. Mitchell of the Depot Quartermasters Office, War Department, appeared before the Commission with a location plan for the Woodhull Memorial Flagpole which is being erected on the south side of the Arlington Memorial Amphitheatre, in accordance with plans prepared by Mr. Hastings. Mr. Mitchell asked the approval of the Commission with reference to raising the pavement of the flagpole from point 175.37 to point 176.25 to bring it more nearly to present ground level. The Commission, upon inspection of the site, recommended constructing the pavement on a level with the proposed roadway near the flagpole, as indicated in the new approved Plan for Arlington (6608-120, August 1921, J. M. G. O., War Department). Mr. Mitchell stated that this would place the pavement approximately at point 177 and that they would proceed accordingly in the construction work.

10. PEACE STATUE AT THE HAGUE: Mr. Moore reported that while in New England the latter part of September he arranged to visit the studio of Andrew O'Connor, at Paxton, Massachusetts, in company with Hon. Samuel E. Winslow, House of Representatives, to see Mr. O'Connor's model for the statue to represent the United States at the Peace Palace at The Hague. Mr. Moore stated that they felt the model is promising of a good work of art, and that in accordance with the wishes of the sculptor he had taken up with the State Department the matter of an inspection trip to Paxton by the members of the Commission; also to have the State Department grant the sculptor permission to work at The Hague in completing the statue.

11. MONUMENT TO UNKNOWN SOLDIER: Mr. Moore stated that it had been the intention of Mr. Hastings to be present at the meeting of the Commission

with designs for the monument to the Unknown Soldier at Arlington, but that Mr. Hastings had written under date of October 23, 1922, that the plans were not ready for submission (Exhibit G.)

12. STATUE OF DANTE: Under date of September 5, 1922, the Commission received the following letter from Colonel Sherrill, regarding the statue of Dante, in Meridian Hill Park:

"The matter of the design of the permanent pedestal for the Dante statue has been under consideration for some months, and I am very anxious to have this finally determined, by the Fine Arts Commission at its next meeting.

As I understand it, the Commission deferred action on Mr. Peaslee's design of the pedestal pending the revision of the model for that area of the park, so as to adapt the monument to its setting.

In view of the fact that the cost of the Dante Statue is to be paid entirely by the agency which donated the monument to the United States, I feel sure that they would not be favorably inclined toward spending money for the revision of the models and plans of the park in the vicinity of this monument. On the other hand the Government is not in a position at this time to spend any money on the Dante monument, nor on the modification of the design of the park in that neighborhood. Consequently, if the Fine Arts Commission can come to a conclusion as to the type of pedestal desirable for this monument without revision of the model, I would suggest that this be done and that the matter of designing appropriate surroundings for this monument be deferred until such time as the Government is prepared to go ahead with this work."

Mr. Peaslee appeared before the Commission with sketches for the permanent pedestal and Scheme A was approved, height of base 6'-4". The Commission also considered a landscape setting for the statue in keeping with the plans for the Lower Garden of Meridian Hill Park, and endorsed a suggested design, which it was understood would be carried out when funds are available (Exhibit H).

13. STATUE OF EDMUND BURKE: The Commission inspected the portrait statue of Edmund Burke in place at Massachusetts Avenue and Eleventh St., N.W. After considerable discussion, the location of the statue in approximately

its present site was confirmed. It was felt that the base should be moved slightly nearer to L Street and twisted a fraction to overcome an illusion of being off-parallel. It was recommended that the walk system be restudied so as to place a cross walk back of the statue, leaving the base step surrounded by turf.

It was recommended that the bronze base be cut so that not more than an inch will show in vertical plane above the granite. The step is to be lowered and the mouldings are to be changed to conform to the drawing.

The following changes are to be made in the inscription: The quotation from Morley is to be eliminated and the data in relation to the gift is to appear on the back of the pedestal. In the latter panel the triangular dots are to be doubled like colons. On the face of the stone, the date is to be raised a trifle or the inscription lowered. The letter "K" in "Burke" is to have a tail-sweep conforming to the letter "R".

The selection of a pink granite was disapproved, even though previously recommended. It was felt that the bronze demanded a darker stone such as Rockport or Stony Creek granite.

The Commission had as their guests at luncheon Mrs. Daniel H. Burnham, of Chicago, whose husband, Mr. Daniel H. Burnham, was Chief of Construction of the World's Fair at Chicago in 1893, Chairman of the Senate Park Commission of 1901 and Architect of the Union Station in Washington, and the first Chairman of the Commission of Fine Arts. Major M. C. Tyler of the United States Engineer's Office, and Mr. Fred G. Coldren, Chairman of the Committee on Parks of the Washington Board of Trade, were also guests of the Commission.

C O P Y

October 31, 1922.

Dear Mr. Nebel:

Your revised design for the reverse of the medal for the United States Bureau of Mines was brought before the Commission of Fine Arts at their meeting October 26, 1922. The Commission selected the enclosed design "A" for the reverse, and suggest the words MINE RESCUE underneath the lantern, as indicated.

With reference to the obverse, will you please inform me if the changes suggested by the criticisms contained in the letter from Mr. Bourquin to Mr. Bailey (copy attached) were made in your model, and if so will you please send me a photograph of the obverse as revised in accordance with these recommendations? The Commission has been informed that the criticism with reference to the elimination of the apron and a correct design of the breathing apparatus is particularly important.

The Bureau of Mines desire a photograph of the obverse, and also of the reverse, embodying the recommendations contained in this letter before giving authority to execute the medal. I shall be glad to bring them to their attention if you will send them to me.

The obverse and the reverse of the full size medal will be mounted side by side, and set in a frame of wood. The engraving proposed to commemorate the award will be placed on a separate plate.

Sincerely yours,

Charles Moore,

Chairman.

B. Nebel, Esq.,
4515 Forbes Street,
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.

EXHIBIT A.

COPY

Pittsburgh, Pa.,
October 18, 1922.

My dear Mr. Bailey:

SUBJECT: First Aid and Mine Rescue Medals.

Mr. Denny has asked that I reply to your letter of October 16, regarding designs for First Aid and Mine Rescue medals.

Mr. Nebel of the Carnegie Institution called at this office recently, and in the absence of Mr. Parker, Mr. Nebel conferred with Mr. Denny and myself regarding the design for the medal being developed under the direction of the Commission of Fine Arts. Later, Mr. Parker and I called upon Mr. Nebel at his studio for another conference on the same subject.

Mr. Parker, Mr. Denny and I offer no particular objection to the position of the victim in the arms of the man equipped with breathing apparatus in the mine rescue design. Our criticisms to this design were as follows: (1) the man wearing the breathing apparatus was illustrated as wearing an apron. Such apparel is not worn in the mines, and we suggest that the apron be eliminated. (2) the rays of light from the safety lamp carried by the man wearing the breathing apparatus appeared to be too pronounced. We suggested that they should be reduced considerably. (3) The cover of the breathing apparatus was shown as extending farther behind the arm of the man wearing the apparatus than would be true to life. It was suggested that this objection of the apparatus be eliminated entirely or at least be reduced, and that the line representing the cover of the apparatus be shown more nearly vertical.

Mr. Nebel wishes to attend a first aid contest or witness a first aid class in action to gain further ideas for the first aid medal. I do not know that any first aid contests are scheduled to be held in the Pittsburgh district in the near future, but we will endeavor to assist Mr. Nebel in any way possible to secure ideas for the design.

Nothing was said to Mr. Nebel by Messrs. Parker, Denny or myself regarding prices or financial arrangements for paying for the designs.

Very truly yours,

(Sgd) J. J. Bourquin,

Acting Chief Engineer, Mine Safety Service,
For D. J. Parker, Chief.

Exhibit A

C O P Y

October 28, 1922.

My dear General Lejeune:

The design submitted with your letter of September 22 for the statue of a Marine at Paris Island, by Robert Aitken, was approved by the Commission of Fine Arts at their meeting on October 26, 1922.

The Commission would be pleased to see the design of the pedestal proposed for the statue, and also a location plan, at such time as it may be convenient for you to submit them.

I am returning the correspondence, attached to your letter, and a photograph of the design.

Respectfully yours,

Charles Moore,

Chairman.

Major General John A. Lejeune, U. S. M. C.,
Commandant, United States Marine Corps,
Washington, D. C.

EXHIBIT B.

October 28, 1922.

Dear Major Tyler:

With reference to the designs which you submitted to the Commission of Fine Arts at their meeting on October 26th, I have to inform you that the Commission are of the opinion that the bridge approach at Rosslyn should be treated as an open plaza, the traffic being directed by stone posts or some similar device. As the work nears completion the opportunities for planting may be considered.

The location of the terminal station of the Washington & Old Dominion Railway met the approval of the Commission. The design of the building was disapproved. The building should take its character from the bridge itself, which gets its distinction from its extreme simplicity and the beauty of its arches. Any building related to the bridge, as this terminal station will be, should maintain throughout the element of simplicity and obtain its effects by the good proportions of the mass and the proper size and spacing of the windows and other openings. The Commission recommends an entire new study of the station along the lines suggested.

Sincerely yours,

Charles Moore,

Chairman.

Major M. C. Tyler,
United States Engineer's Office,
War Department.

EXHIBIT C.

C O P Y

October 28, 1922.

Dear Mr. Douden:

The design which you submitted for a headquarters of the National Literary Society received the attention of the Commission of Fine Arts at their meeting October 26, 1922.

The Commission recommend a restudy of the plans, with the object of simplification.

The Commission held the matter of recommendation of a site for the proposed building in abeyance pending a resubmission of the design.

Sincerely yours,

Charles Moore,

Chairman.

Mr. William Douden, Architect,
501 Seventh Street, N.W.,
Washington, D. C.

EXHIBIT D.

15

C O P Y

October 28, 1922.

My dear Mr. Langley:

Your letter of September 28, 1922, with which you transmitted a copy of House Joint Resolution 378, "To create a commission to consider the proposal of a central building for art and industry in the District of Columbia" was brought before the Commission of Fine Arts at their meeting on October 26, 1922.

The Commission of Fine Arts can see no objection to the study by a Commission of Congress of the subject indicated in the Joint Resolution. It is suggested that inasmuch as the general subject of industrial art is within the scope of the Smithsonian Institution, the secretary of that organization be added to the Commission.

Sincerely yours,

Charles Moore,

Chairman.

Hon. John W. Langley, Chairman,
Committee on Public Buildings and Grounds,
House of Representatives.

EXHIBIT E.

C O P Y

October 30, 1922.

Dear Colonel Sherrill:

Your letter of October 2, asking for the views of the Commission of Fine Arts with reference to a suitable site for the proposed Statue to Baseball, was brought before the Commission at their meeting on October 26, 1922.

Inasmuch as the proposed statue will represent the typical American game, the Commission are of the opinion that it should be located in connection with the entrance to that area of East Potomac Park set apart for baseball, football and like games which are witnessed by many people. In this location the statue would have a significance which would not be attained if it were placed in an unrelated position. The Commission tentatively fixed on such a location as giving most inspiration to the sculptor.

Sincerely yours,

Charles Moore,

Chairman.

Lieut. Col. C. O. Sherrill,

Officer in Charge,

Office of Public Buildings and Grounds.

EXHIBIT F.

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

10

C O P Y

October 23, 1922.

My dear Mr. Chairman:

I had hoped, as you know, to be with you at the next meeting of the Art Commission on the 26th of this month and I wrote Colonel Wainwright to try to make my appointment with him for that day, but alas, Secretary Weeks will not be in Washington until after the 7th of November and I am now waiting to hear from them as to when I can see them. I will keep you informed, but this delay precludes the possibility of my being in Washington for the meeting of the Art Commission, which is a great disappointment.

I am making careful perspective drawings and elevations showing the relation of the monument to the Amphitheater. These drawings will not be completed for your meeting, otherwise I would send them on.

Harry Bacon made a good suggestion when I saw him with the drawings of the memorial and want you to know that I feel with him that the design is improved by way of lowering,--taking from the height of the lower section. If we could hope to receive an approval of the general scheme, I would be strongly in favor of building the lower portion to a certain given height and obtaining a full size model, in plaster, of the upper portion and putting it in place so that we could all of us see it before it is too late to change. Of course if this were undertaken we would need a sculptor to make studies of the figures and help us with the full size model. It is an embarrassing situation to obtain the confidence of those higher up in office who have already committed themselves in opposition of our design, but you, and other members of the Art Commission, have certainly been of great help, all of which I appreciate more than I can tell you.

With best wishes, I am,

Always, Faithfully yours,

Thomas Hastings.

Charles Moore, Esq.,
Chairman, Commission of Fine Arts,
1729 New York Avenue,
Washington, D.C.

EXHIBIT G.

November 1, 1922.

Dear Colonel Sherrill:

Replying to your letter of September 5, concerning the pedestal for the statue of Dante in Meridian Hill Park, I have to inform you that this matter received the attention of the Commission at their meeting on September 7th, when sketches were submitted by the architect, Mr. H. W. Peaslee, and resubmitted at the meeting of the Commission on October 26, 1922.

The Commission viewed the sketches for the permanent pedestal and setting of the statue and approved Scheme A, height of base 6'-4". The word "Dante" should be cut in the stone and not applied. There should be no ornament.

The Commission reconsidered the setting of the statue and advise the enlargement of the area so as to include the steps of the east ascent.

The space should be lined with an evergreen hedge, possibly hemlock, back of which there is to be a hedge of trees clipped so as not to infringe upon the enclosure. Oriental plane, beech, holly, hawthorne, or hornbeam were discussed as possibilities. The evergreen hedge will continue on both sides of the cross walk to the Sixteenth Street overlook.

The Commission understand that it is desired to set the permanent pedestal in place as soon as possible, and that the planting will be done when funds are available for that purpose.

Sincerely yours,

Charles Moore,

Chairman.

Lieut. Col. C. O. Sherrill,
Officer in Charge,
Office of Public Buildings and Grounds.

EXHIBIT H.

